Comment on "Topological excitations and the dynamic structure factor of spin liquids on the kagome lattice" (Punk, M., Chowdhury, D. & Sachdev, S. Nature Physics 10, 289-293 (2014))

V. R. Shaginyan,[1,2,*] M. Ya. Amusia,[3,4] J. W. Clark,[5] G. S. Japaridze,[2] A. Z. Msezane,[2] K. G. Popov,[6] V. A. Stephanovich,[7] M. V. Zverev,[8,9] and V. A. Khodel[8,5]

[1]*Petersburg Nuclear Physics Institute, Gatchina, 188300, Russia*
[2]*Clark Atlanta University, Atlanta, GA 30314, USA*
[3]*Racah Institute of Physics, Hebrew University, Jerusalem 91904, Israel*
[4]*Ioffe Physical Technical Institute, RAS, St. Petersburg 194021, Russia*
[5]*McDonnell Center for the Space Sciences & Department of Physics, Washington University, St. Louis, MO 63130, USA*
[6]*Komi Science Center, Ural Division, RAS, Syktyvkar, 167982, Russia*
[7]*Opole University, Institute of Physics, Opole, 45-052, Poland*
[8]*Russian Research Center Kurchatov Institute, Moscow, 123182, Russia*
[9] *Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology, Moscow, 123098, Russia*

arXiv:1409.4034v1 [cond-mat.str-el] 14 Sep 2014

Letter to the Editor — The authors of a recent paper [1] evidently take the view that the whole of progress made toward a theoretical understanding of the physics of quantum spin liquids (QSL) is associated with models of the kind proposed and applied in their present work. As motivation for this work, they observe that in contrast to existing theoretical models of both gapped and gapless spin liquids, which give rise to sharp dispersive features in the dynamic structure factor, the measured dynamic structure factor reveals an excitation continuum that is remarkably flat as a function of frequency. They go on to assert that "so far, the only theoretical model for a spin liquid state on the kagome lattice which naturally gives rise to a flat excitation band at low energies consists of the Z_2 spin liquids", cited as references 2 to 4.

Here we point out that there already exists a different and demonstrably successful approach to the QSL problem that does naturally feature a flat band. This alternative approach is based on the theory of fermion condensation [2], which is concerned with special solutions admitted by the equations of the original Landau theory. Such solutions exhibit a fermion condensate (FC), composed of the totality of single-particle states belonging to a portion of the spectrum that is completely flat in some region of momentum space [3]. It has been shown by Volovik [4] that solutions having a FC belong to a different topological class of Fermi liquids than the conventional ones, even without the visons introduced by the authors of [1] as "topology carriers". Importantly, the effective mass of a Landau quasiparticle now acquires a dependence on external parameters. This further development of the original Landau theory provides for studies of characteristic non-Fermi-liquid behavior of FC-hosting systems that are associated with dramatic change of the single-particle spectrum under tiny variations of input parameters, including temperature, magnetic field, pressure, doping, etc. In dealing with QSLs, such an approach allows one to gain insight into the physical mechanism operative in herbertsmithite, within the much broader context of similar phenomena in heavy-fermion (HF) metals and quasicrystals. Notably, it permits one to calculate the thermodynamic and relaxation properties of QSL as functions of temperature T and magnetic field B. The crux of the matter within the Landau-theoretic framework is that the kagome lattice of herbertsmithite supports a strongly correlated QSL located at the fermion-condensation quantum phase transition point [2, 5, 6]. The consequences of this conclusion are in good agreement with recent experimental data. Moreover, the unusual behavior exhibited in QSL is seen to have universal character, shared with that observed in such different strongly correlated fermionic systems as HF metals (including the quantum critical metal $Sr_3Ru_2O_7$, 2D ^{3}He) and quasicrystals [2, 7, 8].

The FC theory gives a consistent, even quantitative, account of many of the physical properties of quantum spin liquids. In particular, it allows for calculation of the temperature- and magnetic-field dependence of their specific heat, dynamic magnetic susceptibility χ and reveals their scaling behavior [5, 6]. The theory relates such different phenomena as the QSL heat conductance in a magnetic field with the magnetoresistance in HF metals, as well as with the spin relaxation rate in QSL and HF metals [9, 10]. Moreover, FC theory can describe the imaginary part of χ, exposing its scaling properties, which have been shown to be similar to those found in HF metals. The imaginary part of the dynamic susceptibility is of special importance since it can be directly measured in neutron scattering experiments [9]. Thus, the spin excitations in $ZnCu_3(OH)_6Cl_2$ exhibit the same behavior as electron excitations of the HF metal and, therefore form a continuum. Based on the good agreement with experiment achieved in the cited theoretical studies, the FC theory predicts the results of the key experiment of Han et al. [11] showing that the excitations in the spin-liquid state of the kagome antiferromagnet

form a dispersionless continuum [9].

We were unable to check the results of the paper [1] because the presentation is fragmentary and lacks calculated results for the observable physical properties of QSL addressed above within FC theory. By contrast, within the context of FC theory, the presence of a flat band in herbertsmithite was predicted [5, 6] before its actual experimental discovery [11]. All these results stand in vivid contrast with those of the paper [1], where only a qualitative analysis of the dynamic structure factor $S(\mathbf{k}, \omega)$ is presented. Finally, as should already be apparent, references related to FC theory are absent from [1].

* Electronic address: vrshag@thd.pnpi.spb.ru

[1] Punk, M., Chowdhury, D. & Sachdev, S. Topological excitations and the dynamic structure factor of spin liquids on the kagome lattice. *Nat. Phys.* **10**, 289-293 (2014); arXiv:1308.2222.

[2] Shaginyan, V.R., Amusia, M. Ya., Msezane, A.Z. & Popov, K.G. *Phys. Reports* Scaling Behavior of Heavy Fermion Metals. **492**, 31-109 (2010).

[3] Khodel, V.A. & Shaginyan, V.R. Superfluidity in systems with fermion condensate. *JETP Lett.* **51**, 553 (1990).

[4] Volovik G.E. A new class of normal Fermi liquids. *JETP. Lett.* **53**, 222 (1991).

[5] Shaginyan, V.R., Msezane, A.Z. & Popov, K.G. Thermodynamic properties of the kagome lattice in herbertsmithite. *Phys. Rev. B* **84**, 060401(R) (2011).

[6] Shaginyan, V.R., Msezane, A.Z., Popov, K.G., Japaridze, G.S. & Stephanovich, V.A. Identification of strongly correlated spin liquid in herbertsmithite. *Europhys. Lett.* **97**, 56001 (2012).

[7] Shaginyan, V.R., Msezane, A.Z., Popov, K.G., Clark, J.W., Zverev, M.V. & Khodel, V.A. Flat Bands and Enigma of Metamagnetic Quantum Critical Regime in $Sr_3Ru_2O_7$. *Phys. Lett. A* **377**, 2800 (2013).

[8] Shaginyan, V.R., Msezane, A.Z., Popov, K.G., Japaridze, G.S. & Khodel, V.A. Common quantum phase transition in quasicrystals and heavy-fermion metals. *Phys. Rev. B* **87**, 245122 (2013).

[9] Shaginyan, V.R., Msezane, A.Z., Popov, K.G. & Khodel, V.A. Scaling in dynamic susceptibility of herbertsmithite and heavy-fermion metals. *Phys. Lett. A* **376**, 2622 (2012).

[10] Shaginyan, V.R., Msezane, A.Z., Popov, K.G., Japaridze, G.S. & Khodel, V.A. Heat transport in magnetic fields by quantum spin liquid in the organic insulators $EtMe_3Sb[Pd(dmit)_2]_2$ and $\kappa - (BEDT - TTF)_2Cu_2(CN)_3$. *Europhys. Lett.* **103**, 67006 (2013).

[11] Han, T.-H., Helton, J. S., Chu, S., Nocera, D.N., Rodriguez-Rivera, J.A., Broholm, C. & Lee, Y.S. Fractionalized excitations in the spin-liquid state of a kagome-lattice antiferromagnet. *Nature* **492**, 406 (2012).